

SOUTH CAMBRIDGESHIRE DISTRICT COUNCIL

REPORT TO: Planning Committee

2 March 2011

AUTHOR/S: Executive Director (Operational Services)/
Corporate Manager (Planning and New Communities)

**S/1997/10 - BARRINGTON
ERECTION OF EXTERNAL SHELTER
BARRINGTON COFE VC PRIMARY SCHOOL, HASLINGFIELD ROAD,
BARRINGTON FOR MRS F CATTERSON**

Recommendation: Refusal

Date for Determination: 25 January 2011

The application has been referred to the Planning Committee at the request of Councillors Murfitt and Kindersley.

Planning Committee Members will visit the site on the morning of 2nd March.

Site and Proposal

1. The application site is Barrington Primary School. The school buildings comprise the original rendered and thatched mid-19th century building and Victorian extension fronting the road with later 20th century extensions to the rear and North East. The original school building is Grade II Listed. The specific location of the proposed structure is in the corner of an existing playground directly to the rear (East) of the 19th century thatched building and to the South side of the Victorian extension. There is a demountable classroom to the West of the playground area and directly to the South is the boundary with the village church. The school is located within the Barrington Conservation Area.
2. The application is for a timber and polycarbonate shelter to serve pupils in the Reception class.

Policies

3. DP/2 – Design of New Development
DP/3 – Development Criteria
CH/4 – Development within the Curtilage or Setting of a Listed Building
CH/5 – Conservation Areas

Supplementary Planning Guidance

4. Listed Buildings – Adopted July 2009
Development Affecting Conservation Areas – Adopted January 2009

Consultations

5. Parish Council – has recommended approval.
6. Conservation Team – has recommended refusal on the grounds that the proposed shelter would harm to the special character and appearance of the Listed Building and would neither preserve nor enhance the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

Representations

7. No representations have been received in respect of the proposed development.

Planning Comments

8. The main planning considerations in this case are the impact on the setting of the Listed Building and the impact on the Conservation Area.
9. Impact on the setting of Listed Building - The proposed shelter would be sited in a sensitive location in close proximity but not attached to the thatched part of this Grade II listed school. It would however read as an attached building in views of the rear of the listed building. While the rear of the building is not particularly prominent in public views, it would be seen in views from and across the church grounds to the South of the school. The roof form of the shelter is not traditional, being of very shallow pitch and the structure is relatively large; the floor plan of the proposed shelter being comparable to the largest room in the existing historic part of the building. The materials, namely half round redwood poles and polycarbonate roofing, are not traditional materials and would not complement the white render and thatch of the original building or the brick and slate of the Victorian extension. The design of the shelter with partially open areas at ground level and "planting tubs" is also considered to be inappropriate for this location.
10. The proposed development is therefore considered to harm the setting of the Listed Building.
11. It has been suggested to the school that the structure be located further from the Listed Building close to the gable end of the demountable classroom to the East, however the school's Headteacher has expressed concern that this would be too distant from the reception classroom to function as required. The requirements of the *Statutory Framework for Early Years Foundation Stage, 2008* and *The Early Years Foundation Stage Effective Practice: The Learning Environment, 2007* have been cited as requiring that a shelter be provided for the children. Although it is accepted that such a facility is needed, it is not considered that it has been adequately demonstrated that an alternative location further from the listed building would not still meet these requirements. On that basis, it is not considered that the need for the shelter in a location so close to the reception classroom has been adequately demonstrated to outweigh the harm to the setting of the Listed Building.
12. Impact on the Conservation Area – Given the harm caused by the shelter to the setting of Listed Building and the contribution that the Listed building makes to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area, the proposed shelter is also

considered to be detrimental to the Conservation Area as it would neither preserve nor enhance its character and appearance.

Recommendation

13. Having regard to applicable national and local planning policies, and having taken all relevant material considerations into account, it is recommended that the applications be refused Planning Permission, for the following reason(s):
 1. The proposed shelter would harm the setting of the 19th century timber framed and thatched school building by virtue of its form, proportions, materials and design. The proposal is considered to be inappropriate in form and design and would result in a visually intrusive building that compromises the special character and appearance of the rear elevation of the building. The materials, which include polycarbonate and half round timber redwood poles, are uncharacteristic and inappropriate within the setting of a building of this type and age. The proposal is therefore considered to be contrary to Policy CH/4 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Development Framework Development Control Policies DPD 2007: Policy HE 6.1, HE 7.2 and HE 7.5 of Planning Policy Statement 5: Planning and the Historic Environment; PPS5 Historic Environment Planning Policy Practice Guide (including paragraphs 68, 70, 76, 80, 117, 121, 122), and paragraph 4.38 of the Local Development Framework SPD Listed Buildings: Works to or affecting the setting of (2009).
 2. The listed building makes a strong visual contribution to the Conservation Area. Due to its inappropriate form, proportions, materials and design which would harm the setting of the Listed Building, the proposed extension would neither preserve nor enhance the character and appearance of the Conservation Area. The proposal is therefore contrary to Policy CH/5 of the South Cambridgeshire local Development Framework Development Control Policies DPD 2007 and the Development Affecting Conservation Areas SPD 2009.

Contact Officer: Daniel Smith - Planning Officer
01954 713162